

UNIVERSITY OF CINCINNATI

August

19 75

I hereby recommend that the thesis prepared under my supervision by William Edwin Domb

entitled

AN EVALUATION AND COMPARISON OF SELECTED

20TH-CENTURY ORGAN INSTRUCTION BOOKS

be accepted as fulfilling this part of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Musical Arts in Organ Performance

Approved by:

Philip D. Crabtree

Leslie Austin

Roberta Gary

AN EVALUATION AND COMPARISON OF SELECTED
20TH-CENTURY ORGAN INSTRUCTION BOOKS

A Thesis Submitted to the
Division of Graduate Studies
of the
University of Cincinnati

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree of
DOCTOR OF MUSICAL ARTS IN ORGAN PERFORMANCE
In the College-Conservatory of Music
August, 1975

by

William Edwin Domb

B.M., Oberlin College, 1967

M.M., Eastman School of Music, 1969

UMI Number: DP15729

INFORMATION TO USERS

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleed-through, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

UMI®

UMI Microform DP15729

Copyright 2009 by ProQuest LLC.

All rights reserved. This microform edition is protected against unauthorized copying under Title 17, United States Code.

ProQuest LLC
789 E. Eisenhower Parkway
PO Box 1346
Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The proposal for this thesis was prepared under the guidance of Dr. Donald H. Foster. The writer is indebted to his advisor, Dr. Phillip D. Crabtree, and to his major applied teacher, Dr. Roberta S. Gary, both of whom offered critical and practical suggestions for improvement as the writing progressed.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter		
I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	AREAS OF EVALUATION	6
III.	EVALUATION OF THE SELECTED METHODS	
	Clarence Dickinson, <u>The Technique and</u> <u>Art of Organ Playing</u>	11
	Marcel Dupré, <u>Méthode d'Orgue</u>	16
	Fernando Germani, <u>Metodo Per Organo</u>	18
	Flor Peeters, <u>Ars Organi</u>	22
	Harold Gleason, <u>Method of Organ Playing</u>	27
	Finn Viderø, <u>Orgelschule</u>	32
	Everett Jay Hilty, <u>Principles of Organ</u> <u>Playing</u>	35
	C. H. Trevor, <u>The Oxford Organ Method</u>	40
	Mildred Andrews and Pauline Riddle, <u>Church Organ Method</u>	46
	David N. Johnson, <u>Instruction Book for</u> <u>Beginning Organists</u>	51
IV.	COMPARISON OF THE SELECTED METHODS	56
V.	CONCLUSIONS	61
	APPENDIX Additional 20th-Century Organ Methods	63
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	64

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

Organ teaching is an art which requires aptitude, study, expertise, and application. Colleges, conservatories, and universities today are producing more fine organists than ever before. However, because of the major emphasis placed on performance, the ability to transmit or teach one's art has been neglected. The beginning organ teacher usually employs the one or two methods he used as a student, and makes unnecessary mistakes in judgment because he lacks expertise in selecting the proper method to fit each student's background and ability.

The word "method," by its very nature, implies an orderly process through which a stated goal is achieved. The goal in organ playing must be the total mastery of the instrument. The means for accomplishing this goal, in this writer's opinion, must be the systematic presentation of both the technical and musical dimensions of the art.

The problem undertaken in this thesis was to evaluate and compare selected 20th-century organ instruction books according to their pedagogical merits. The purpose of the thesis, as implied above, was to provide a reference tool to assist the organ teacher in selection of the most appropriate

instruction book for his particular situation.

Because of their particular preëminence, influence, and availability, the following instruction books (listed chronologically) were chosen for evaluation and comparison:

- Dickinson, Clarence. The Technique and Art of Organ Playing. New York: H. W. Gray, 1922.
- Dupré, Marcel. Méthode d'Orgue. Paris: Alphonse Leduc, 1927.
- Germani, Fernando. Metodo Per Organo. 4 vols. Rome: Edizioni de Santis, 1951, 1954.
- Peeters, Flor. Ars Organi. 3 vols. Brussels: Schott Frères, 1953, 1954.
- Gleason, Harold. Method of Organ Playing. 5th ed. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1962.
- Viderø, Finn. Orgelschule. Copenhagen: Wilhelm Hansen, 1963.
- Hilty, Everett Jay. Principles of Organ Playing. Boulder, Colo.: Pruett, 1971.
- Trevor, C. H. The Oxford Organ Method. London: Oxford University Press, 1971.
- Andrews, Mildred, and Riddle, Pauline. Church Organ Method. New York: Carl Fischer, Inc., 1972.
- Johnson, David N. Instruction Book for Beginning Organists. Rev. ed. Minneapolis: Augsburg Publishing House, 1973.

HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

"In Art, the true element of life lies in its evolution."¹ This statement by the great French organist Louis

¹Jack R. Crawford, "Mes Souvenirs by Louis Vierne: An Annotated Translation" (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Miami, 1973), p. 215.

Vierne (1870-1937) led the writer to investigate the historical traditions of the various instruction books under consideration. It was found that a direct teacher-pupil succession existed from the Belgian organist and teacher, Jacques Lemmens (1823-1881) to the present day.

Lemmens studied with the Breslau organist Adolph F. Hesse.² In 1862, he published his École d'Orgue. The two-part method, which was based on plainsong, approached the study of technique in a systematic, rational manner. Lemmens' manual technique was intended to produce a legato style. His preliminary exercises for single note substitution, substitution in parallel thirds and sixths, and finger and thumb glissandi have been enlarged upon in the 20th-century methods.

Lemmens' most important contribution to organ pedagogy was in the area of pedaling. Lars Nilson, in the Preface to his 1904 book on pedaling, states,

. . . it is a pleasant duty to acknowledge the Organ-School of J. Lemmens . . . ; for this work, breaking away as it does at once from the tramping method of former days, may with justice be called a school of reform in pedalling.³

The following excerpts, translated from Lemmens' École de la Pédale (Part Two of École d'Orgue), show his innovative ideas:

²A teacher-pupil succession exists from J. S. Bach to Lemmens as follows: J. S. Bach (1685-1750), Johann C. Kittel (1732-1809), Johann C. Rinck (1770-1846), Adolph F. Hesse (1808-1863), Jacques Lemmens (1823-1881).

³Lars Nilson, A System of Technical Studies in Pedal Playing (New York: G. Schirmer, 1904), p. ii.

The pedal is one of the most essential parts of the organ. In order to acquire a certain degree of ability on this instrument, it is necessary to place all one's attention to knowing its use well.

A great number of organists play the pedals with only the left foot. This bad method obliges the player to move the same foot in place of the other. . . . As for the fast passages . . . it is impossible to dream of executing these in this manner.

.
One plays the pedal with both feet: first, pushing with the toe or heel; second, sliding [glissando] with the same foot; third, substituting one of the feet for the other or substituting the toe to the heel or vice versa.

.
The easiest and most commonly used passages are those which permit the playing of the feet alternately.

.
The substitution is equally of great resource in connecting difficult pedal passages. . . .

The arpeggios on the pedal have been regarded until now as impractical. However, the execution becomes easier if one passes the toe of the left foot back of the heel of the right foot. By this system the feet are not cramped.

.
Before ending these explanations, we will observe that it is preferable in fast passages to use the slide rather than the substitution: The slide only demands the movement of one foot, while substitution demands the movement of two.⁴

The exercises deal systematically with the use of toe alternation to learn interval span, the extensive use of the heel in playing scales, and the importance of the use of pedal glissandi. These studies, together with Lemmens' sound principles of execution, form the basis for modern pedaling.

The French organists, Alexandre Guilmant (1837-1911) and Charles-Marie Widor (1844-1937) were students of Lemmens. Their distinguished pupils, Marcel Dupré (1886-1971) and

⁴Jacques Lemmens, École d'Orgue, Part Two: École de la Pédale (Brussels: Schott Frères, n.d.), p. 1.

Clarence Dickinson (1873-1969), transmitted the tradition to the middle of this century. Mildred Andrews, a former Dupré student, continues the direct teacher-pupil succession today.

While no other direct teacher-pupil succession can be established, secondary relationships are apparent. Joseph Bonnet (1884-1944), a Guilmant student, was one of Harold Gleason's teachers. In a similar relationship, Arthur Poister, a student of Dupré, taught David Johnson.

Flor Peeters studied at the Lemmens Institute in Mechelen, later taught there, and today is the leading exponent of the Lemmens tradition. Thus, it is apparent that the authors of these 20th-century organ methods are indebted to Jacques Lemmens.

CHAPTER TWO

AREAS OF EVALUATION

The preliminary approach to deriving the areas of evaluation involved three steps as follows:

1. The collection of proposed areas relating to characteristics of organ pedagogy. Ideas were obtained not only from the organ methods under discussion, but also from additional methods (see Appendix), from articles in professional journals, and from discussions with organ teachers and students.

2. The categorizing of statements describing the same characteristic.

3. The selection of area headings which best expressed the thought of the various statements describing the same characteristic.

From the above procedure the following five area headings evolved:

- Scope and Sequence
- Introductory Material
- Technique Development
- Style Development and Artistic Growth
- Skills and Resources

It is the writer's belief that all five areas should be present in an organ instruction book. The following discussion will enlarge upon each of the area headings and provide the evaluative basis for this thesis.

Scope and Sequence

Scope and sequence involves a review of the author's objectives. These objectives will be illuminated by questions such as the following: What was the philosophy behind and the motivation for this method? For what type of student was the method intended? Did the author succeed in achieving his purpose? The second phase in this area is a survey of the sequence and progression of materials. Is the organizational format presented so that it has meaningful order and constitutes a pattern discernible to both the student and teacher?

Introductory Material

This area investigates the features each author deems important as an introduction to the organ. Questions such as the following will be considered: Does the author give specific rules for position at the organ or does he survey the art of organ building? Does he discuss mechanical features of the instrument or present hints for practicing? Are the general tonal resources of the organ presented?

Technique Development

The beginning organ student can progress only as rapidly as each element of technique is understood and diligently practiced. Since the very nature of method books implies more space devoted to the development of technique than any other feature, this area is divided into four parts. These are 1) manual technique, 2) pedal technique, 3) co-ordination studies for manuals and pedal, and 4) physical control and relaxation.

Parts one and two as found in the method books usually contain exercises in the tradition of Lemmens. The explanations behind these exercises will be evaluated for clarity of purpose and for success or failure in achieving that purpose. Part three generally contains invented three-part exercises which rapidly progress to more difficult compositions. It is the writer's contention that most method books slight this important stage of the student's development. Hence, careful scrutiny will be given to the number of exercises, their progressive rate of difficulty, and their inherent musical value. Since the ultimate goal of technique development is the ability to create music, physical control and relaxation (Part four) are of major importance. Donald McDonald states, "Wrong notes are caused by wrong actions immediately before the mistake occurs--all inaccuracies are the results of wrong motions."¹ Playing a musical instrument requires combining mental and physical abilities to control the body's nerves and muscles.² Therefore, the degree of emphasis placed on control in the method books will be judged.

Style Development and Artistic Growth

Two interrelated but uniquely different concepts are

¹Donald G. McDonald, "Some Guiding Principles in the Art of Organ Study and Performance" (unpublished S.M.D. thesis, Union Theological Seminary, 1964), pp. 48-49.

²Extensive research in this area is provided by Orpha C. Ochse in "Pedagogical Implications of Research Studies in Three Determinants of Organ Performance Ability" (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Rochester, 1953).

considered under this heading. Style development is educating the student to bring to expression the musical ideas of the composer. For stylistic appropriateness, the student must understand all the characteristics of the music--its composer, his period, and his country. In addition, the student should have knowledge of the basic construction and tonal characteristics of the organ for which the music was written. Evaluation in the area will consider the types of literature presented for study, and how effectively performance practice techniques and registration principles are employed to give the music its fullest expression.

Artistic growth, the ultimate goal behind all method books, is an evolutionary process in which the student's skill and creative power combine in an aesthetic achievement. Even though the discussion of profound artistic ideas is inhibited by a language obstacle, nevertheless, the method book must contribute to an environment which nurtures the student's musical enlightenment.

Skills and Resources

This area involves an examination of the quantity and quality of supplementary material in each instruction book. Questions such as the following will be asked: To what extent is hymn playing dealt with? Are practical skills such as sight reading, transposition, accompanying, and improvisation introduced? Are appropriate resource materials such as organ specifications and illustrations included?

After each instruction book has been evaluated according to the five area headings, the results will be synthesized and the writer's comprehensive evaluation presented. In 1891, Charles-Marie Widor remarked to his pupil and assistant, Louis Vierne, "One must understand two, three, and four times what one is teaching. That will incite you to more profound thinking, and you will be obliged to search for perfection. . . ." ³ Hopefully, the following evaluations will yield realistic judgments from which teachers and students can select the proper instruction book to stimulate them in their search for perfection.

³Jack R. Crawford, "Mes Souvenirs by Louis Vierne: An Annotated Translation" (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Miami, 1973), p. 72.

CHAPTER THREE

EVALUATION OF THE SELECTED METHODS

CLARENCE DICKINSON,
THE TECHNIQUE AND ART OF ORGAN PLAYING

Clarence Dickinson, one of the founding fathers of the American Guild of Organists and a professor of organ at Union Theological Seminary, wrote The Technique and Art of Organ Playing in 1921. In the Preface, Dickinson states:

This book is designed to provide the teacher with the technical material necessary to carry the student from the beginning of his studies through to the acquirement of complete command of his instrument. The aim has been to include in one volume a study of all the distinctive principles of organ technique, with enough illustrations and exercises through which they may be mastered, together with interesting compositions which will at once call for their application.¹

The method's format is divided into two parts. The textual division, Part One, is a reference book which describes each point of the technique. Also included are illustrations to aid the student in comprehension and application. Part Two, the music, supplies the student with the necessary exercises and pieces to learn the various techniques. Dickinson writes,

. . . the exercises and pieces are never mere studies, but are such as will be of use to the organist always,

¹Clarence Dickinson, The Technique and Art of Organ Playing (New York: W. H. Gray Co., Inc., 1922), p. 5.

and of so great variety in style that effective recital programs can be made from just these numbers.²

Dickinson's introduction to the instrument is an historical prospectus on the origin and development of the organ. In this section, as throughout the book, Dickinson's writing style is colorfully descriptive rather than scholarly. The reader is provided insights into the organ world of the early 20th century. Concluding the introduction, Dickinson classifies each stop from a large imaginary instrument. This instrument, based on Romantic organ principles, includes stops such as a 16' Contra-Gamba, an 8' Stentorphone, an 8' French Horn, and a 4' Celestina.

Dickinson's treatment of manual technique is for an instrument with electric or pneumatic action. In fact, he states, "the old mechanical action is passing so rapidly that it does not now require detailed consideration."³ Since Dickinson did not die until 1969, one wonders what his impressions of post-World War II organ construction developments were.

After directing the student's attention to the importance of attack and release, Dickinson discusses manual touches. He stresses that the attainment of a perfect legato touch is essential to organ playing.

If you play on two keys in succession there will be a moment at which your first key ceases to sound and

²Ibid.

³Ibid.

a moment at which the second key begins to sound. Legato playing means that these shall be not two different moments, but one and the same moment. . . .⁴

The techniques of substitution, glissandi, and crossing are presented as aids in sustaining a true organ legato. An extensive treatment of the thumb glissando is given.

. . . you must treat each hand as if it were equipped with six fingers instead of only five. The second joint of the thumb, or, to be more exact, the side of the thumb between the first and second joints, is to be considered an extra finger; and the side of the thumb between the second joint and the third, or axis,⁵ is also to be treated as an independent finger.⁵

These "independent fingers" help to maintain the legato when playing parallel first inversion chords involving black keys. The exercises to develop the legato touch are based on Lemmens' École d'Orgue, and as Dickinson writes,

Anyone who has ever watched Alexandre Guilmant [student of Lemmens and teacher of Dickinson], the master who attained the most perfect legato we have known in organ playing, could not fail to be struck by the manner in which his hands seemed to creep over the keys, as it were, weaving in and out.⁶

Three other touches are discussed by Dickinson. They are 1) semi-detached, 2) marcato, and 3) staccato. This writer recommends this section as a performance practice source for the student studying the late 19th-century French symphonic style.

In the area of pedal technique, Dickinson first discusses

⁴Ibid.

⁵Ibid.

⁶Ibid.

the proper shoe. It should be as narrow as possible, and have a medium weight sole so as not to interfere with the sensitivity of the foot. The feet must remain flat on the pedalboard, and the ankle controls the attack in which the keys are pressed, not struck. Each interval is learned as the basis of note location, and the gap system is criticized as an aid which destroys confidence. Dickinson writes, "One who has taught many organists realizes how many are veritable slaves to this 'black-note habit'."⁷ The opening exercises for alternate feet treat each interval systematically. Later legato exercises dealing with the heel, glissando, and substitution are presented. Finally, Dickinson presents pedal scales and arpeggios, double pedal exercises, and studies for the development of non-legato touches.

The initial coordination exercises are unique because the pedal part employs only one interval. For example, if the student has mastered the sensation of the fourth, he should be able to easily combine the manual parts with the pedal. More difficult exercises and compositions by Lemmens, Mendelssohn, Guilmant, and Eslava are added gradually.

Dickinson is concerned about the student's development in the area of musicianship. Chapters on accent, rhythm, ornamentation, manipulation of the swell pedal, and registration and color are included in the textual division. Many of the ideas presented in these chapters are as valid today as in 1921. However, the reader must be cautioned against early

⁷Ibid.

20th-century performance practices such as the use of the swell pedal in Bach.

Special note must be made of the chapter on "Adapting Piano Accompaniments to the Organ." The student is told how to treat the repeated chords, arpeggios, extreme skips, and tremolo chords that are so common in the oratorio literature. "It is Enough" from Mendelssohn's Elijah is given as an example. The present writer judges this chapter an extremely valuable demonstration of a most practical skill.

The Technique and Art of Organ Playing includes thirty-three compositions by nineteen composers. Approximately half of the pieces are by great composers such as Bach, Couperin, and Franck. The other half of the pieces are by lesser known composers including Archer, Best, and Steggall, all of whom wrote British organ methods in the late 19th century. All the pieces are completely edited by Dickinson in a style not considered valid today.

Dickinson's instruction book was the first major organ method written in the United States in this century. The method was extremely popular because it supplied a direct link with the great 19th-century French school of organ playing. As viewed today, the method's value is twofold. First, it provides the student with an excellent commentary on organ playing in the early 20th century, and second, it supplies the teacher with a comprehensive organ instruction book in the pedagogical tradition.

MARCEL DUPRÉ,
MÉTHODE D'ORGUE

Marcel Dupré wrote Méthode d'Orgue in 1927, one year after his appointment as professor of organ at the Paris Conservatory. According to the Foreword, the method is intended for the beginning student whose piano background has included all scales and arpeggios in their various combinations. The method's format consists of two parts: 1) organ technique, and 2) principles of organ playing based on examples drawn from the works of Johann Sebastian Bach. Part Two is a reference manual dealing with rules of voice leading and ornamentation. In reality, this method is simply a technique book. Therefore, only features in the third area will be evaluated.

Dupré's approach to technique (Part One) is straightforward. Each exercise must be learned thoroughly before the next is started, and all exercises mastered before pieces are studied.

Concerning manual technique, Dupré advocates slightly curved fingers in constant contact with the keyboard. A straight line should extend from the wrist to the base of the fingers, and no physical strain should be required to depress the keys. Dupré implies that this system of touch, total finger action with no wrist movement, results in a legato style of playing. While pure legato was the major style of playing in 1927, the

present writer believes that the wide variety of touches used today can be best controlled with wrist action. Brief explanations accompany the exercises which often are intended to be transposed. It is significant that the most space is devoted to glissandi and substitution exercises, two techniques extremely useful in the performance of Dupré's own organ works.

The pedal exercises are based on intervals. The student is reminded to keep his knees as close together as possible and his feet in constant contact with the pedalboard. Many of the exercises are taken directly from the second volume of Lemmens' École d'Orgue. In addition to the exercises, Dupré gives his pedaling for difficult passages in major Bach organ works. This section is valuable because the student can study and compare his own pedaling with that of a master virtuoso.

Coordination exercises for hands and feet conclude Part One. These exercises are miniature etudes and the writer judges them too difficult for the beginning student. However, they are useful as technique sharpeners and transposition exercises for the more advanced pupil.

Since all the features treated in this manual are found in comprehensive method books, the Méthode d'Orgue is most valuable as a reference tool. Historically, this volume is important because it perpetuates the tradition of a rational approach to the study of technique initiated by Lemmens. This tradition was transmitted to Dupré by Lemmens' pupils, Alexandre Guilmant and Charles-Marie Widor.

FERNANDO GERMANI,
METODO PER ORGANO

Fernando Germani, organist of St. Peter's Basilica in the Vatican, conceived his organ method in 1939. The method was to be divided into the following parts:

- Part I Manual Legato
 Pedal Technique
- Part II Exercises for Manual and Pedal
- Part III Execution of Ornaments
 in 16th- to 18th-Century
 Organ and Harpsichord Music
- Part IV
 Volume 1 Art of Registration⁸
 Volume 2 Art of Interpretation
 Volume 3 History, Registration and
 Construction of the Organ

The first three parts of Germani's method were not published until 1951. Part IV, Volume 1 was published in 1954, and as far as this writer has been able to determine, the remaining two volumes have not been published.

In the Foreword to Part I, Germani states that the prospective organ student should have full mastery of Muzio Clementi's Gradus ad Parnassum etudes. He believes that these piano studies, when played at the indicated metronome speed,

⁸Since this volume was not available for this study, the present writer's comments are based on Harold Helman's review. See "From an Organist's Notebook," Musical Opinion, LXXVII (May, 1954), pp. 491, 493.

produce sufficient finger technique.

Legato playing is emphasized in the section on manual technique. The legato style is achieved by keeping the fingers in constant contact with the keys, and by holding each note until the exact moment the next note is played. The usual exercises (based on scales) are given with instructions to transpose them into all keys with the same fingering. The thumb glissando is the only technique which has a written explanation. The briefness of this section indicates that Germani has geared his method to the advanced student. This writer judges the exercises to be sufficient drill for the accomplished pianist.

Germani advocates a pedal position in which the knees and heels are kept together as much as possible, making the feet incline slightly inward. No system of note location is given. The first exercise is a C major scale in which each note is repeated sixteen times. The first eight repetitions are for the toe and the second eight, for the heel. The purpose of this exercise is to develop a flexible ankle because leg movement is forbidden. The remaining twenty-seven pages of exercises, the most difficult this writer has encountered, are based on Lars Nilson's A System of Technical Studies in Pedal Playing (1904). While the writer judges Germani's drills impractical for the beginner, he admits that the student mastering them would possess a spectacular pedal technique.

Part II of Metodo Per Organo is the study of major and

minor scales and arpeggios for manuals and pedals in octaves, thirds, sixths, and various double combinations. Germani states that these exercises are of great importance in the execution of works by contemporary composers. Since the type of contemporary music to which Germani refers is not stated, the present writer disputes the above statement and believes that the student's time could be better spent in learning pieces rather than practicing pyrotechnics.

Ornamentation practices of organists and harpsichordists in the 16th-18th centuries are surveyed in Part III. Original ornamentation signs and their proper realizations are given for major composers in Italy, France, Germany, Spain, and England. The volume provides the student with excellent reference material for the interpretation of signs of ornamentation for this period.

The Art of Registration (Part IV, Volume 1) is based on the principle that intelligent registration requires knowledge of the composer and the type of instrument for which he wrote. Sixteenth- through twentieth-century organs in Italy, France, Germany, England, Spain, and America are presented with specifications and photographs where available. Germani's accompanying text is lucid and thorough. Helman feels that every serious organ student should be acquainted with this worthwhile volume, although the volume is not readily available.

In summary, this writer recommends limited use of Germani's technique sections (Parts I and II). They appear best suited for the mature beginner with excellent piano technique, or the advanced organist who wishes to improve his

pedal technique. The books on ornamentation and registration (Part III and Part IV, Volume 1) are endorsed for their scholarly presentation of historical material.

FLOR PEETERS,
ARS ORGANI

Ars Organi is Flor Peeters' three-volume instruction book dating from 1953-54. The text, which is presented simultaneously in Dutch, French, English, and German, reflects Peeters' international reputation as a gifted organist, composer, and teacher.

In the Preface, Peeters states that a well-developed piano background is a necessity before commencing organ study. The often overlooked importance of thoroughly mastering the elementary technique exercises is also emphasized. Since each technique is separately categorized from the simple to the complex, the teacher's judgment must determine the order of presentation. Thus, the student with a sound background will profit from exposure to parts of all three volumes concurrently.

Peeters maintains from the beginning of study that the student's interest must be aroused and nurtured in the following areas: mechanical and tonal structure of the instrument, practical acoustics, registration and performance practices, and literature of the instrument. Through the Ars Organi, Peeters intends to help the young student develop into a genuine musician. In his own words, "The aim of this method

is to give the pupil both an aesthetic and technical formation."⁹

Peeters' introductory material deals with the instrument and methods of study and practice. In Chapter One, on the design of the instrument, Peeters expertly summarizes its mechanical operation, console equipment, and tonal characteristics. A chart of stop pitches in relation to the note played and the harmonic series is a valuable addition. Finally, a list of stops in common use and classified in tonal families is given. A well-written second chapter, which this writer would recommend to even the experienced organist, extols the value of proper study and practice methods. Here, Peeters advocates habits such as analytic study, consistency in fingering and pedaling, practicing in a slow tempo, historical study for stylistic awareness, and systematic training of the memory. The present writer considers the material and its presentation in this area a success.

Elementary exercises for finger attack and release are found in Chapter Three. Peeters states that the hands must be motionless, with the fingers in contact with the keys. At the moment of attack a flexible elastic finger acts decisively. Even though no written explanation of the exercises is provided, they are sufficient in number and cover the basic skills of legato and detached combinations, finger crossing and stretching, substitution, and glissando. Chapter Four, "Rules for Performance," is the standard presentation of printed excerpts from the literature with their corresponding execution.

⁹ Flor Peeters, Ars Organi (3 vols.; Brussels: Schott Frères, 1953-54), p. 6.

A discussion of ornamentation based on Bach's Clavierbüchlein für Wilhelm Friedemann Bach concludes this section.

Manual technique is continued in Chapter Five, which contains twenty graded, two-part manual pieces. Fingering, phrasing, and registration are given. The music, which is in a variety of styles, introduces the student to composers such as Pachelbel, Gigault, and Peeters himself. The final pieces in this section would provide a challenge to an experienced player. Thus, the teacher must thoroughly know all three volumes of Ars Organi to utilize the method effectively.

Elementary pedal technique is presented in Chapter Six. Peeters recommends the "gap" method of note location. Both the knees and feet should be held close together with the feet maintaining contact with the pedals. All leg movement is superfluous; the attack is done quickly and decisively from the ankle joint. Alternate toe pedaling involving repeated notes, white notes only, white and black notes, and various intervals is presented in exercises of increasing difficulty. Four original pedal etudes by Peeters conclude this chapter. These studies, while somewhat difficult, are nevertheless valuable. The feet are producing music rather than simply playing an exercise, and the satisfaction gained from this experience is important in the beginning student's musical growth.

The final chapter of Volume I contains the first coordination studies for manuals and pedal. One hand is added to a pedal part using only alternate toes. Again, the exercises have fingering, phrasing, and registration. While

Peeters has provided great variety in his invented exercises, the writer feels that the rate of increasing difficulty is too rapid.

Since Peeters utilizes the same procedure--progressing from the simple to the complex--in Volumes II and III of the Ars Organi, only the most unusual features in this area of technique development will be presented. In order to prepare the student for three-part manual playing in which the middle voice often must be divided between the hands, Peeters includes as Chapter Eight a group of exercises taken from J. E. Habert's Praktische Orgelschule. These exercises are in two voices, fingered for either hand. They are intended to develop the student's ability to play two voices in one hand with precision.

The use of the heel is introduced at the beginning of Chapter Nine. Significantly, the initial exercises are to be practiced on a silent keyboard. While this time-honored practice method is orthodox, it is the first time this writer has seen it suggested as an aid in learning a new skill. Peeters' method for practicing pedal scales (Chapter Thirteen) is interesting. As tempo is increased, two- and four-note groups result. By stressing the first note of each group, the ankle remains free and flexible. Thus, smooth and relaxed pedaling results. Mention must be made of Chapter Nineteen which completes the musical exercises in Ars Organi. Six original etudes confront the student with specific demands: scales, arpeggios, irregular rhythms, and octaves. For the first time, fingering and pedaling are left to the student's discretion.

In Chapter Twenty, "General Aesthetic," Peeters presents

his thoughts on phrasing, touch, interpretation, and registration. No specific ideas are given. However, valuable generalizations, which often are assumed, are stated for the student's consideration.

No practical skills are explored in Ars Organi. However, the following resource materials adequately conclude this classically-oriented organ instruction book. A "Chronological Survey of Organ Specifications" provides the stop lists of fifteen important historical instruments built between 1511 and 1949. The final entries are a four-year program of supplementary literature, a list of works for organ and orchestra, and an index of organ stop nomenclature.

Ars Organi, which ranks among the best of the comprehensive organ methods, is appropriate for the serious student. Acknowledged strengths are the abundance of the graded technical exercises, the great variety in the classical compositions, and the relevance of the written material. At the end of the Preface, Peeters lists thirty-three methods, many by forgotten teachers of the last century, which he consulted before compiling Ars Organi. His aim was to synthesize and amplify the important features in these books, and it would appear that he succeeded in accomplishing his purpose.

HAROLD GLEASON,
METHOD OF ORGAN PLAYING

Harold Gleason's Method of Organ Playing was written in 1937. The revised fifth edition, dating from 1962, is used in this evaluation. Since the method's format is divided into seven parts which closely parallel this writer's five areas of evaluation, each of the parts in Method of Organ Playing will be given separate treatment.

Part One opens with introductory remarks which mainly are directed toward the teacher. Gleason stresses the necessity of a well-grounded piano background before beginning organ study. He explicitly states that the student must have musically and technically mastered the following: Cramer's Studies; Bach's Three-part Inventions; sonatas by Beethoven, Haydn, and Mozart; and all major and minor scales in their various combinations at given metronome indications. Gleason states that his method presents material in progressive order. Some areas, such as pedal technique, are provided with sufficient exercises for four years of study. Thus, it is the teacher's responsibility to properly use the method with each individual student. Finally, Gleason concludes his remarks by emphasizing the importance of study in all areas of music. "It is scarcely necessary to point out that any art requires

a lifetime of study."¹⁰

The remainder of Part One (twenty pages), in this writer's opinion, is an unparalleled storehouse of information. Gleason gives a general description of the instrument, and then discusses classes of pipes and qualities of tone color. The arts of registration and ornamentation are analyzed according to century, country, and composer. Part One concludes with Gleason's ideas on style and interpretation, including points on accent, articulation, phrasing, timing, increasing and decreasing tension, and tempo.

In Part Two, Gleason treats manual technique. He recommends a hand position in which curved fingers are in constant contact with the keys. The arm and wrist, which must be flexible and relaxed, are level with the finger tips. The student must aim for complete muscular control of this position. When this control has been acquired, a variety of touches on instruments with different actions are possible. Concise instructions for execution accompany the exercises, which are based on the Lemmens tradition.

Rules for part-playing are illustrated in Part Three. Also found in this section is a discussion of non-legato touches, and hymn playing techniques. It is interesting to note that Gleason recommends at least one year of organ instruction prior to the study of hymn playing.

Part Four, "Manual Compositions," opens with discussions

¹⁰Harold Gleason, Method of Organ Playing (5th ed.; New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1962), p. 1.

on fingering and memorizing. Gleason maintains that the best performances result when the music is played from memory; and he provides sound advice on techniques to develop that skill. This writer supports Gleason's opinion, and finds it regrettable that the art of memorization is rapidly being lost. The manual compositions survey organ literature from the mid-fifteenth century to the present day, from Conrad Paumann to Herbert Elwell. The writer judges these pieces appropriate for the serious student.

Pedal technique is treated in Part Five. After an historical introduction to this art, Gleason recommends the toe-heels-toe span method of note location. He also suggests the use of special shoes, experimentation with the hands in different positions when practicing the pedals alone, and a daily exercise to stretch and strengthen the ankle muscles. The exercises, which deal with all the various techniques of pedaling, frequently are intended to be transposed. In the writer's opinion, a solid pedal technique will result if the exercises are studied over a four-year period as Gleason intends.

Coordination studies and compositions for manuals and pedal are found in Part Six. The five invented studies work well with a student first attempting this difficult skill. The present writer only wishes that Gleason had included more preliminary exercises of this caliber. As was observed in the section on manual compositions, Gleason selects pieces in a great variety of styles. Fifty-three works of definite musical value are provided with fingering,

pedaling, phrasing, and some registration suggestions. A student studying these pieces with a competent teacher would be well exposed to all eras of organ composition except the Romantic period which Gleason slights.

Part Seven consists of scales for manuals and pedal. These exercises, intended to be started during the pupil's second year of study, employ all the major scales in a variety of combinations. Also included is an excellent summary on the basic principles of pedaling.

Appendices are a significant feature of this instruction book. They include graded courses in both piano and organ playing, organ specifications from Schlick (1511) to Franck (Sainte-Clotilde, 1859), a very complete list of Renaissance and Baroque organ music (including publishers), and the most extensive bibliography found in any of the evaluated methods. The final entry is a marvelous series of illustrations. Here the student can see a Spanish organ tablature by Cabezón, pages from Michael Praetorius' Organographia (Part Two of the Syntagma musicum), and portraits of Bach.

In this writer's opinion, Gleason's Method of Organ Playing is the most comprehensive instruction book included in this study. The author's historical, scholarly treatment of musicianship combined with his practical, systematic approach to technique have resulted in a volume that will challenge and inspire the serious student. In the introduction, he states, "The purpose of this book is to provide the musical and technical foundation necessary for the mastery of the art of organ

playing."¹¹ No author has succeeded better than Gleason in accomplishing this difficult goal.

¹¹Ibid.

FINN VIDERØ,
ORGELSCHULE

Finn Viderø, the internationally known Danish organist, published his Orgelschule in 1963. In the Preface, Viderø clearly defines the purpose and scope of his instruction book.

This volume is intended to give the student the necessary technique for playing the classic organ music. . . . As an organ primer the volume deals only with manual and pedal technique and coordination of the hands and feet. Problems of registration and style have on purpose been left out of consideration. For practical reasons the manual and pedal exercises have been placed in separate sections in order of increasing difficulty. The student should take up the study of both sections simultaneously and continue to practice these exercises even after he has begun to play pieces with pedal.¹²

The manual exercises are preceded by a discussion of hand position and touch. Viderø proposes that the shoulder, elbow, forearm, and wrist all participate with the fingers at the moment of attack. A high wrist controls the attack, and the slightly curved fingers straighten out toward the keybed. After the attack, the shoulder muscles maintain the arm weight. It has been this writer's experience that the above position produces unnecessary tension. In contrast to Viderø's ideas, the writer believes that a low, flexible wrist best controls the attack. After the attack, relaxation can occur only when

¹²Finn Viderø, Orgelschule (Copenhagen: Wilhelm Hansen, 1963), p. 1.

arm and shoulder weight is focused in the knuckles. Concerning touch, Viderø writes, ". . . detached playing . . . should be approached through the legato and should be obtained by shortening the values of the single notes but only as much as the musical expression requires."¹³ The present writer fully supports this statement.

The opening exercises deal exclusively with the five-finger position based on d¹, rather than the usual c¹. These invented exercises work not only in unison octaves, but also in canon at the octave. Thus, Viderø has introduced the student to modality and polyphony, two characteristics found frequently in the literature. The technique of crossing the thumb and fingers over and under follows. Viderø obviously realizes that many organists use a substitution where a simple crossing would be sufficient. As a result, he stresses this technique by providing a large number of exercises. Standard substitution and glissando exercises, plus ornamentation hints and voice leading rules, conclude this part on manual technique.

Viderø's pedal technique is based on the kinesthetic sensation method of note location. Simply stated, nerve endings in the feet feel and locate the notes through the soles of the shoes. The knees and heels should be kept as close together as possible, and the majority of pedaling should be done by the toes. The writer judges the exercises to be too difficult for the beginning student. For example, on the

¹³Ibid.

second page of the exercises, the student is given the opening pedal solo from Georg Böhm's Prelude and Fugue in C Major.

Eleven brief exercises (cadence extensions, miniature cantus firmus pieces, and short fugal expositions) introduce manual and pedal coordination. While these exercises are accessible to the beginning student, the writer feels that the following pieces from the literature progress too rapidly for a student with minimal background.

Orgelschule is a method book that deals in what to play, rather than how to play. Detailed explanations of the basic techniques are left to the teacher. While this writer suggests that the book could be used for technique review, he recommends it mainly as an economical source of Baroque literature: Viderø has provided the student with an excellent collection of 17th- and early 18th-century music in the German, French, and Italian styles.

EVERETT JAY HILTY,
PRINCIPLES OF ORGAN PLAYING

Thirty-five years of teaching experience preceded Everett Jay Hilty's publication of Principles of Organ Playing. This method, dating from 1971, is organized on a progressive unit basis. Thus, the teacher and student are not required to jump around throughout the book for the different techniques. Each of the ten units includes manual and pedal technique, performance practice suggestions, and an annotated repertoire list.

In the Preface, Hilty suggests that the book can be used as a programmed course of self-instruction, or as a textbook for the student having regular instruction. Unfortunately, no mention is made of the student's background.

Hilty's introductory material is twofold. First, an excellent page on intelligent practicing is given. Second, a section on the principles of registration as viewed by an organ builder is provided. Norman Lane, of the firm of Meunier Associates, Denver, Colorado, wrote the introduction, which this writer recommends be reread many times for its many valuable suggestions.

The area of manual technique shows Hilty's use of three pedagogical devices. First, a principle of execution summarizes the written discussion before each series of exercises. As

an example, the principle applying to the techniques which are necessary for maintaining a pure legato (finger crossing, substitution, and thumbing) is given below: "For a perfect legato, always manipulate the fingers in such a way that they are over the next notes to be played before the time to play them."¹⁴ Second, when presenting a technique such as substitution, an example from the literature is included so that the student can discover the inherent problems himself. Then Hilty provides exercises to deal with the problem, and finally he presents the example again, edited with fingering and phrasing. The present writer considers this approach whereby the written aspect is compared with the played aspect to be a highly successful instructional device. Third, since Principles of Organ Playing is designed as a comprehensive, sequential method, the ideas found in one unit are continually being further developed and reinforced in other units. Thus, thumbing (glissando), which is given initial treatment in Unit Two, is found again in Units Three, Four, Five, Six, and Eight.

In this writer's opinion, all the standard manual techniques are given thorough treatment. Sufficient exercises mixed with excerpts from the literature provide much variety for the student. Of special note are Hilty's presentation of thumbing (complete with photographs), his development of touch variations, and his ideas on accent without dynamic means.

¹⁴Everett Jay Hilty, Principles of Organ Playing (Boulder, Colo.: Praett Publishing Company, 1971), p. 12.

Hilty does not advocate any of the standard systems of pedaling. His ideas on pedaling are based on the premise that the best technique is the most natural technique. Therefore, the preliminary exercises are concerned with playing white notes with alternate feet, and black and white notes with the same foot. Hilty's principle of execution states:

The foot remains touching silently the note it has played until time to play the next note, then skates quietly and swiftly to the new note. The distance traversed by the same foot is the interval to be learned mentally and muscularly. Use ankle motion.¹⁵

In addition, he recommends a basic position in which the toe of the right foot is kept an inch from the black notes, and the toe of the left foot, even with the right heel. The majority of the exercises found in the method are carefully designed to promote this manner of pedaling. While the present writer does not teach pedaling this way, he acknowledges the soundness of this pedagogical approach.

The initial coordination exercises are well-designed. In fact, the pedal part is annotated to help the student see to what interval the foot must "skate" next. The student is told that he must develop the ability to read three staves at once, and practicing each line alone is a waste of time. This writer judges these exercises within the grasp of all students.

The area of style development and artistic growth is dealt with throughout Principles of Organ Playing. Many

¹⁵Ibid.

quotations from composers and performance practice authorities are included to help the student in his search for performance authenticity. In the writer's opinion, Hilty has successfully correlated theoretical and technical knowledge. Standard compositions are not included in this method. However, at the end of each unit an excellent repertoire list is given. This annotated list, which includes music of all periods and styles, is a valuable addition for the beginning teacher who is faced with the task of choosing appropriate materials for the first time.

An excellent unit which illustrates the realities of hymn playing concludes the method. Hilty understands that this skill seldom receives the attention it demands, and as a result, he has provided much thoughtful advice for the student.

Additional materials include: advice on adapting piano accompaniments to the organ; an annotated bibliography on organ history, construction and design, and interpretation; and a list of addresses of domestic and foreign publishing companies.

In summary, this writer judges Principles of Organ Playing an unqualified success. The method's comprehensive unit format is innovative and unique among the instruction books in this study. In the present writer's opinion, Hilty's method is best suited for the conservatory piano major who is required to take two years of organ instruction. In addition to the development of basic organ technique, the student would gain a valuable perspective into the musical

traditions of the instrument.

C. H. TREVOR,
THE OXFORD ORGAN METHOD

The Oxford Organ Method by C. H. Trevor, published in 1971, is a single volume work designed "to enable the student to cope with the technical problems found in organ music of various styles."¹⁶ The means for accomplishing this goal are vaguely defined in the Preface. Trevor states that the student must be able to play the piano reasonably well, have acquired good practice habits, have a working knowledge of the rudiments of music, and be able to think things out for himself. Statements such as these are too vague to be meaningful. A more precise definition of the prospective student's skills would be a valuable aid for the teacher in determining the method's usefulness.

Since Trevor believes that the organ is the most mechanical of all musical instruments, he reasons that the student must gain complete technical mastery of the preliminary exercises. These exercises, which progress from the simple to the complex, are concerned with the following: 1) position at the console, 2) playing of repeated notes, 3) touch difference between the piano and organ, and 4) use of the expression pedals. The

¹⁶ C. H. Trevor, The Oxford Organ Method (London: Oxford University Press, 1971), p. 1.

method's format consists of ten parts which may be studied individually or simultaneously, depending on the student's progress and the teacher's judgment.

Trevor's introductory material (Part One) deals exclusively with the console. The student is advised to acquaint himself with the compass of the manuals and pedals; to familiarize himself with the various mechanical accessories; and to experiment with each stop to learn its pitch, power, and tonal characteristics. Unfortunately, no discussion of these features is provided. However, considerable space is devoted to the proper positioning of the organ bench. The inevitable conclusion is that the position is correct when the student can sit balanced, relaxed, and in contact with the manuals and pedals without any sense of strain. This writer feels that Trevor's priorities in this area are misguided.

Part Two in The Oxford Organ Method is an extensive treatment of pedal technique. Long detailed explanations, which the reader must decipher in order to find Trevor's basic ideas, accompany each exercise. The gap method combined with "a complete mental picture of the geography of the pedal board"¹⁷ is used for note location. Other features of this "footing" system, such as the emphasis placed on maintaining a flexible ankle, playing with the inner side of the foot, and the use of rhythmic patterns during practice time, are orthodox. Unorthodox features of the footing system include

¹⁷Ibid.

the use of ordinary walking shoes, and the introduction of the heel at the beginning of the exercises. In general, the exercises progress too rapidly for the average student. More concise explanations on Trevor's part coupled with added exercises to reinforce his ideas would produce stronger pedal technique.

Standard introductory remarks precede each group of exercises in the area of manual technique (Part Three). In contrast to the treatment of pedal technique, the explanations in this section are brief, over-simplified, and at times non-existent. No explanation of the thumb glissando, the most unusual of all organ techniques, is given. The order of the exercises is significant because the combination of legato and detached touches in one hand is treated at the end. In spite of the above comments, this writer considers this section successful because Trevor has included excerpts from the literature to reinforce the various techniques. For example, in the section on substitution, the right hand part of the concluding measures of Messiaen's Verset pour la fête de la Dédicace is given. Thus, the student can immediately apply his newly learned technique, and the exposure to literature of various periods provides for musical growth.

Rules for part-playing are illustrated in Part Four. Since they are given standard treatment, no discussion is necessary in this context.

Coordination studies for manuals and pedal are found in Part Five of The Oxford Organ Method. Four-part homophonic

exercises are presented immediately. While some suggestions for fingering, pedaling, phrasing, registration, and practice technique are given, the student has so much freedom that bad habits easily could be developed. This writer feels that additional exercises on a more elementary level are needed so that the average student can avoid frustration when first combining the hands and the feet. The remainder of the exercises are contrapuntal in nature and show excellent perception on Trevor's part. Exercises for the left hand and pedal, which work equally well with the right hand and pedal, precede simple trios. Initially, the trios are extended cadence patterns. Trevor gradually increases the degree of difficulty, and a student who masters the twenty-four trios in this section will have developed good coordination skills.

Also included in Part Five are seventeen short fugal movements from the 1689 edition of Wegweiser die Orgel recht zu schlagen. This method, which was extremely popular in central and southern Germany in the early 18th century, is likely to have been the organ primer used by J. S. Bach. This writer has found these pieces not only valuable for, but popular with the beginning organ student. In summary, the gradual progression of difficulty, plus the abundance of material make this section the most successful part of The Oxford Organ Method.

Style development and artistic growth are neglected by Trevor. Careful study of the six-page glossary (Part Eight) will yield basic facts about mechanical and tonal features of the organ. However, interpretative terms like rubato and agogic accent are avoided.

Part Nine consists of short pieces by composers from Cabezón and Frescobaldi to Boëllmann and Reger. Although no interpretative suggestions are given by Trevor, this writer judges these works to be within the technical reach of the beginning student. In addition, their diversity of form and mood make them valuable as voluntaries or interludes in church service work.

Additional materials are a significant feature of The Oxford Organ Method. In the section on the use of the Swell pedal (Part Seven), Trevor advises the student that, ". . . the first inch or two of opening the box [Swell Pedal] is the most effective. Closing the box, the last inch or two is the most effective and needs most control."¹⁸ In his conclusion (Part Ten), Trevor emphasizes that, "No two organs are quite the same and what is suitable on one is not necessarily suitable on another."¹⁹ While statements such as these appear to be obvious, it is this writer's opinion that seeing the obvious in print is beneficial.

To summarize, The Oxford Organ Method cannot be considered a comprehensive instruction book because Trevor makes no attempt to teach interpretation. While the present writer has voiced much criticism about this method, he does not intend to downgrade its many positive features. Especially valuable are the coordination studies, the short pieces in different

¹⁸Ibid.

¹⁹Ibid.

styles, and the supplementary materials. On balance, The Oxford Organ Method possibly would be most useful for the organ enthusiast with some previous training and experience in the field who wishes to improve his skills for his own gratification.

MILDRED ANDREWS AND PAULINE RIDDLE,
CHURCH ORGAN METHOD

Church Organ Method by Mildred Andrews and Pauline Riddle is the published product stemming from a doctoral dissertation which Riddle produced under Andrews' guidance at the University of Oklahoma in 1972.²⁰ As the title indicates and the Preface states, this book is a course of study for the beginning church organist. The principles of manual and pedal technique are presented in fifteen lessons which progress from the simplest exercises to the playing of four-part contrapuntal compositions and hymns. Each lesson is planned to anticipate the questions and problems the beginning student might encounter. Therefore, while nothing can take the place of a competent teacher, the method is also intended to help the student who studies alone.

An excellent discussion of fundamentals, including divisions of the organ, stops, couplers and pistons, expression pedals, and pipes, precedes Lesson One. The organist's basic

²⁰Riddle's research design included the writing and testing of a method for the purpose of teaching hymn playing to high school students. See Pauline Riddle, "Development of a Basic Foundation in Church Organ Technique for the Beginning Organist" (unpublished D.M.E. dissertation, University of Oklahoma, 1972).

language is provided in a concise easy-to-understand manner as shown by the following example:

Registration is a term used to designate the combination of stops chosen for a particular piece or section of a piece. On many organs there are some buttons under the manuals which are called pistons. . . . Pistons make it possible to change the registration rapidly.²¹

Since the various aspects of manual and pedal technique are treated together in each lesson, a review of the contents from a randomly selected lesson (Lesson Seven) will help to focus attention on the method's format.

Manual Exercises

Crossing Fingers

Pass one Finger over another Finger

Pass one Finger under another Finger

Substitution for Major and Minor Broken Chords

Thumb glissando

Compositions for Manuals

Buttstedt, J. H. . . . "Air"

Hymn Tune . . . SEYMOUR (S.A.T.)

Pedal Exercises

Toes and Heels on White Keys

Toes and Heels on Black and White Keys

Manual Exercises

Double Substitution of Chromatic Minor Thirds

Compositions for Manuals and Pedal

Pachelbel, Johann . . . "Choral"

Dandrieu, J. F. . . . "Noel"

Specific instructions about position at the organ, the necessity for special shoes, and the importance of a good piano background precede the introduction to manual technique in Lesson One. Andrews and Riddle stress the necessity of good

²¹Mildred Andrews and Pauline Riddle, Church Organ Method (New York: Carl Fischer, Inc., 1972), p. 6.

hand position. The fingers are curved with the tip of each finger under the first joint, as if holding a baseball. The arm and wrist are level with the tips of the fingers. The keys are pressed down with a firm precise movement and quickly released in the same manner. The student must aim for a good legato touch with finger sensitivity so that a variety of touches can be developed later. This writer judges these instructions to be concise and adequate for the beginning student.

Five finger exercises in various major and minor keys for attack and release are presented first. The student is reminded to use the printed fingering, and to count aloud as he plays. Legato thirds, combining legato and detached notes, and crossing of fingers over the thumb complete Lesson One.

More advanced manual techniques are treated in other lessons as the following outline shows:

Lesson Two	Glissando
Lesson Three	Substitution
Lesson Four	Legato Sixths
Lesson Six	Finger Extension
	Double Substitution in Thirds
Lesson Seven	Crossing Fingers
	Substitution in Broken Chords
	Thumb Glissando
Lesson Eight	Substitution in Chromatic Scales
Lesson Nine	Double Substitution in
	Chromatic Minor Sixths

As each technique is introduced, specific instructions are given for its execution. Andrews' and Riddle's choice of this pedagogical approach in which nothing is left to chance is supported by this writer.

Pedal technique (Lessons Four through Fifteen) is given

the same systematic treatment as manual technique. The basic system of pedaling is introduced in Lesson Four. Both the toe and heel must maintain contact with the pedals, and a decisive attack is made by the ankle. To reach the extreme ends of the pedalboard, the technique of body pivoting is discussed. This important technique, which many authors have omitted, is given excellent treatment by Andrews and Riddle. The toe-heels-toe span method of note location is advocated. The opening exercises promote this method in which the size of the various intervals is learned by habit. It is interesting to note that the authors state that the gap system should be avoided. In this writer's opinion, Andrews and Riddle have combined an effective presentation and a good ordering of exercises to produce a strong pedal technique in the beginning student.

No formal coordination exercises for manuals and pedal are given in this method. The first instance where the hands and feet are combined is at the end of Lesson Seven, approximately halfway through the method. Here, Johann Pachelbel's four-voice chorale setting of Werde munter, mein Gemüte is given. This writer judges this piece to be too difficult for the student's initial attempt at manual and pedal coordination. However, in many of the pieces which follow, the coordination problems are easier. Andrews and Riddle have reversed the usual pedagogical process, but once the student meets this initial challenge his progress should be more rapid.

Since the method is a course of study for the beginning church organist, hymns provide a majority of the literature

to be studied. In Lesson Eight, Andrews and Riddle discuss the techniques of hymn playing including tying of repeated notes, division of the alto voice between the hands, registration, and the hymn's function within the service. Other literature includes partita movements by Pachelbel and duos and trios by Dandrieu.

In summary, this writer judges Church Organ Method to be a success. The method's design and manner of presentation shows Andrews' and Riddle's insight into the needs of the beginning student. If the student masters the principles in each lesson, he will have acquired a solid technical foundation in organ playing. This writer recommends this volume as an excellent first method for the high school student who hopes for a professional career, or as a programmed course of instruction for the pianist who suddenly finds himself a church organist.

DAVID N. JOHNSON,
INSTRUCTION BOOK FOR BEGINNING ORGANISTS

David N. Johnson originally wrote Instruction Book for Beginning Organists in 1964. In 1973, a revised edition appeared in which sections on coordination and easy trios were added. Eliminated were exercises for playing on two manuals with one hand, and exercises for legato playing of a three-voiced texture in the left hand. Many practical hints and musical insights were added, and some exercises were moved to different chapters. The 1973 revised edition was the one used in this study.

In the Preface, Johnson states that his book is designed for the beginning church organist whose piano background has included some technical and artistic mastery of works by Bach, Haydn, Beethoven, Chopin, and contemporary composers. The volume's practical and flexible approach permits the teacher to tailor the method to the needs of the individual student.

Johnson concludes the Preface with the following statement which this writer believes should be a basic tenet of every organ teacher's philosophy.

An instruction book should not be used merely as a book of technical exercises. Technique is only one aspect of musical artistry, and not an end in itself. It should be kept in mind that

organists are attempting, above all else, to create beauty. Of course it is always true that sufficient technical ability must be available for performances of complete control and competence; nevertheless, technique for its own sake is not a legitimate consideration, since music must be considered an art rather than a craft. Although some exercises in this book (especially at the beginning phases of instruction) are merely drill, with virtually no expressive musical content, the attempt has been made to invest most assignments with a bit of musical substance, even at the elementary stages; these should be approached as opportunities for the student to make music.²²

Johnson's "Introduction to the Instrument" (Chapter One) is an orientation tour of the organ. He offers suggestions to help the student discover a comfortable, relaxed, and balanced position. He discusses proper care of the instrument, which is followed by an investigation of tonal features. While holding a chord, the student is advised to listen to each stop individually and determine its relationship to c¹. The experimental approach, which this writer judges valuable at the student's first lesson, is continued in the areas of mechanical features and elementary registration suggestions.

Basic pedal technique is introduced in Chapter Two with further development in Chapters Six and Ten. Rather than advocating one system of note location, Johnson summarizes the four accepted methods (gap, central reference, kinesthetic sensation, and toe-heels-toe span), and states that the methods can be used separately or in combination at the teacher's discretion. The exercises, composed for toes alone by the

²²David N. Johnson, Instruction Book for Beginning Organists (rev. ed.; Minneapolis: Augsburg Publishing House, 1973), p. iv.

author, are built on a wide variety of intervals, keys, meter signatures, and tempo indications. Already in these opening exercises, Johnson's attempt to provide musical substance is apparent. The final exercises are without a doubt too difficult for the beginning student. This fact is acknowledged in a note to the instructor in which Johnson recommends that assignments must be made from various chapters simultaneously according to the student's stage of development. The use of the heel is introduced in Chapter Six. Chapter Ten contains a series of miniature etudes for the advanced student based on difficult pedal techniques such as substitution on a black note and crossing of feet.

In this writer's opinion, Johnson's treatment of basic manual technique (Chapter Three) is superficial. No discussion of hand position is given, and only eight exercises are provided for the techniques of substitution, crossing of fingers, and finger glissandi. While the importance of the thumb glissando in maintaining a complete legato texture is recognized, no exercises are provided to develop this technique.

Chapters Seven and Eleven treat the problem of voice leading. Rather than reproducing the typical examples from the literature with their execution, Johnson illustrates the various problems encountered in the linear style of organ music with his own invented examples. Some examples are followed by illustrations of typical errors that commonly occur in them. This writer recommends the practicality of this section.

The technique of repeated notes, which is usually taught first in most method books, is discussed last by Johnson

(Chapters Fourteen and Fifteen). While the present writer believes that inevitably the teacher will present this technique earlier, he can see that its presentation at this point is because of the artistic and acoustical questions related to its varying degrees of execution. A survey of the exercises previous to Chapter Fourteen reveals almost no repeated notes. Johnson's meticulous thoroughness in the preparation of this instruction book must be acknowledged.

Coordination studies are interspersed throughout Johnson's Instruction Book for Beginning Organists. The beginning two- and three-part exercises are feasible for any student of average ability. As the exercises increase in difficulty, the student gradually is given freedom to work out his own fingering and pedaling.

In maintaining his aim that the student must be nurtured in musical expression, Johnson constantly supplies insights for creative growth. This feature is very apparent following Exercise 122. Here, Johnson gives the student an "artistic analysis" of the composition. The other phase in area four, style development, is neglected except for a token presentation of ornamentation (Chapter Nineteen). There are no compositions by any composer other than the author except for thirteen well-known hymns. This writer believes that the student needs a more diversified initial exposure to organ literature; hence he recommends that much supplementary material from the classic repertoire be provided.

The final third of this instruction book is an excellent manual on church service playing. Hymn playing

and all its ramifications are treated in Chapter Seventeen. This writer recommends that Chapter Twenty-One, "The Organist in Church Work: Service Playing," be studied thoughtfully by every church musician. The method concludes (Chapter Twenty-Two) with a brief introduction to improvisation. This practical skill, which has not been developed by the majority of organists, is broken down into four elements: tonality, harmony, design, and melody. Practice aids are given for each element, and the present writer judges this section successful because Johnson has attempted to cultivate the creative skills inherent in the student.

In summary, Instruction Book for Beginning Organists is a method with varying degrees of quality. Weaknesses include the ineffective presentation of basic technique, and the lack of compositions in a variety of styles. Strengths include helpful practice suggestions, useful insights into artistic development, and the valuable presentation on church organ playing. This writer recommends this volume primarily as a resource book which should be included in the library of every organ teacher.

CHAPTER FOUR

COMPARISON OF THE SELECTED METHODS

In this chapter, the ten instruction books under consideration will be compared. The arrangement of this comparison follows the five areas of evaluation (Chapter Two). Each method will be referred to by its author rather than its title.

The area of scope and sequence usually contains a statement of objectives, recommendations concerning piano background, and a discussion of the method's format. Each of the methods, except Germani, gives some statement of objectives. Andrews & Riddle and Johnson are intended for the church organist. Dupré and Viderø are designed to develop technique in the beginning student. The remaining methods (Dickinson, Peeters, Gleason, Hilty, and Trevor) propose to treat both the student's technical and musical development. Dickinson, Hilty, and Andrews & Riddle are designed to be used as a programmed text if desired. The piano requirement varies from no mention (Viderø) to an explicit description of a recommended six-year course (Gleason). Generally, the authors give vague recommendations for prerequisite piano study. Only two organizational formats or approaches are used in the instruction books: a) eight of the ten methods employ a segregated approach

in which each element is treated from the simple to the complex; b) the remaining two methods (Hilty and Andrews & Riddle) use integrated progressive units.

Great variety in the type and amount of introductory material was observed. Dupré, Germani, and Viderø make no presentation in this area. The majority of the methods (Dickinson, Peeters, Hilty, Trevor, Andrews & Riddle, and Johnson) discuss fundamentals, including position at the instrument, mechanical and tonal features, and proper ways to practice. The most complete presentation was found in Gleason. Here all ramifications of the art are discussed.

In Chapter Two of this study, technique development was divided into four parts: 1) manual technique, 2) pedal technique, 3) coordination studies for manuals and pedal, and 4) physical control and relaxation. Each of these will be discussed separately below.

Hand position is usually the first feature treated in manual technique. The consensus of opinion is that the fingers must be somewhat curved and in contact with the keys. However, many ideas are forwarded concerning the wrist. Viderø advocates a high wrist; Andrews & Riddle and Gleason support a level, flexible wrist; and Dupré implies that no wrist movement is involved. Except for Johnson's own invented exercises, the exercises in the remaining books are based on Lemmens. Germani, Peeters, and Trevor do not give written explanations for execution, while Gleason and Andrews & Riddle provide specific instructions. Special note should be made of Dickinson's

extensive treatment of the thumb glissando, and also of Hilty's photographs of this unique technique.

In the field of pedal technique, five authors (Dickinson, Dupré, Gleason, Viderø, and Andrews & Riddle) advocate the toe-heels-toe span method coupled with the kinesthetic sensation method for note location. Only Peeters and Trevor use the gap method approach. Germani and Johnson support no system, and Hilty advises the student to play the pedals in the most natural way. Special shoes are generally recommended, except for Trevor who states that ordinary walking shoes will suffice. All authors except Johnson and Germani have enlarged and expanded the basic exercises found in Lemmens. Johnson's pedal exercises are original, and Germani's are taken from Nilson.

Different approaches can be seen in the coordination studies. Dickinson, Viderø, and Johnson use invented exercises that start on a very elementary level. Peeters and Gleason use pieces from the literature which develop style awareness in addition to coordination. Dupré and Germani present difficult manual and pedal scales in various combinations.

Practically no emphasis is placed on physical control and relaxation in the instruction books. In fact, Gleason is the only author to use phrases such as "avoid muscular tension" and "produce a feeling of relaxation" in his discussion.

This writer evaluated style development primarily by the literature provided for study. Outstanding coverage of classical organ literature is provided by Peeters and Gleason.

While Viderø includes only Baroque compositions, they contain much variety. Hilty's annotated repertoire lists excel because they include an unprecedented amount of 20th-century music. Dickinson includes not only standard classical works, but also pieces by now forgotten composers. The literature in Andrews & Riddle and Trevor is limited to hymns and short pieces in styles such as the French Baroque. Johnson includes only his own music, and in Dupré and Germani no literature is provided. In the area of artistic growth, it appears to this writer that little guidance is given the student by Dupré, Viderø, Germani, Trevor, and Andrews & Riddle. The other five authors (Dickinson, Peeters, Gleason, Hilty, and Johnson) provide commendable treatment in this difficult area.

Varying amounts of supplementary material are provided by the authors. Concerning practical skills, valuable ideas on hymn playing are given by Dickinson, Gleason, Hilty, Johnson, and Andrews & Riddle. Adapting piano accompaniments to the organ is treated by Dickinson and Johnson. Johnson also provides the only introduction to the art of improvisation. The practical skills of sight reading and transposition are not considered by any of the authors. Scholarly resource material is found only in Gleason and Peeters. Both authors include specifications of historic instruments and a graded course of study among other things.

This chapter was intended to summarize as well as compare the important features of the ten instruction books under consideration in this study. At this point, it becomes obvious that the methods do not develop similar competencies.

This writer's judgment of the best usage for each instruction book will be the subject of the concluding chapter.

CHAPTER FIVE

CONCLUSIONS

At the beginning of this study, the writer was of the opinion that the various instruction books were basically alike. However, as the evaluation progressed, it became apparent that the methods were extremely different. While certain basic principles were treated in all the volumes, each book's usefulness was determined by the extent and manner in which all elements of the art were taught. Of the ten methods evaluated, the present writer judges four as especially valuable today. Gleason's Method of Organ Playing and Peeters' Ars Organi are excellent comprehensive methods, which are best suited for the college or conservatory student. Principles of Organ Playing by Hilty is also comprehensive and, in the writer's opinion, is very appropriate for the college organ minor. Andrews' and Riddle's Church Organ Method is an excellent method for the beginner.

The remaining six instruction books are recommended only as resource material. Dupré's Méthode d'Orgue and Germani's Metodo Per Organo (Parts One and Two) are good sources of additional technical drill. The Oxford Organ Method by Trevor provides the teacher with many useful

coordination studies on the elementary level. Viderø's Orgelschule is a good source book of Baroque organ literature. Instruction Book for Beginning Organists by Johnson appears to be most valuable as a reference tool in the church music field, and Dickinson's The Technique and Art of Organ Playing, as a reference source for early 20th-century performance practices.

During the writing of this thesis, three major ideas evolved which this writer considers essential for the beginning teacher's consideration. First, each student is unique in his talents and abilities and the proper instruction book must be chosen for him. Second, it is the teacher's responsibility to know completely and understand thoroughly how to use the selected method. Third, the teacher himself must be constantly growing in his art and transmitting its living tradition to his pupils. As Mildred Andrews has written,

Teaching is more than a matter of technique; it is an art. The one unchanging fact is that the truly great, the inspired teachers are those who stimulate and challenge the strong student, support and encourage the weak, and by their own ideals and enthusiasm instill in all their students a love for the best in their art.¹

¹Mildred Andrews, "Organ Teaching of 50 Years Surveyed by Master Teacher," The Diapason, LI (December, 1959), 13.

APPENDIX

ADDITIONAL 20TH-CENTURY ORGAN METHODS

- Barnes, Edward Shippen. School of Organ Playing. Boston: Boston Music Co., 1921.
- Carl, William C. Master Studies for Organ. New York: G. Schirmer, 1907.
- Carpenter, Lilian. Basic Organ Technique. Glen Rock, N.J.: J. Fischer, 1955.
- Cooper, Harry E. Organ Playing (A Manual with Illustrations). Boston: Charles Homeyer, 1954.
- Enright, Richard. Introduction to Organ Playing. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1964.
- Evans, Edwin. Technics of the Organ. New York: C. Scribner, 1938.
- Hull, A. Eaglefield. Organ Playing: Its Technique and Expression. London: Augener, 1911
- Hunt, Reginald. The Elements of Organ Playing. London: E. Ashdown, n.d.
- Koch, Caspar. The Organ Student's Gradus ad Parnassum. Glen Rock, N.J.: J. Fischer, 1945.
- Nevins, Gordon B. First Lessons on the Organ. Bryn Mawr, Pa.: O. Ditson, n.d.
- Peeters, Flor. Little Organ Book. Evanston, Ill.: McLaughlin and Reilly, 1957.
- Stainer, John. The Organ. New edition, revised and enlarged by F. Flaxington Harker. New York: G. Schirmer, 1909.
- Woodward, Enid M. An Organ Primer. Northfield, Minn.: Carleton College, 1959.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books

- Andrews, Mildred, and Riddle, Pauline. Church Organ Method. New York: Carl Fischer, Inc., 1972.
- Arnold, Corliss Richard. Organ Literature: A Comprehensive Survey. Metuchen, N. J.: Scarecrow Press, 1973.
- Dickinson, Clarence. The Technique and Art of Organ Playing. New York: H. W. Gray, 1922.
- Dupré, Marcel. Méthode d'Orgue. Paris: Alphonse Leduc, 1927.
- Germani, Fernando. Metodo Per Organo. 4 vols. Rome: Edizioni de Santis, 1951, 1954.
- Gleason, Harold. Method of Organ Playing. 5th ed. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1962.
- Hilty, Everett Jay. Principles of Organ Playing. Boulder, Colo.: Pruett, 1971.
- Johnson, David N. Instruction Book for Beginning Organists. Rev. ed. Minneapolis: Augsburg Publishing House, 1973.
- _____. Organ Teacher's Guide. Minneapolis: Augsburg Publishing House, 1971.
- Lemmens, Jacques. École d'Orgue. Part Two: École de la Pedale. Brussels: Schott Frères, n. d.
- Nilson, Lars. A System of Technical Studies in Pedal Playing. New York: G. Schirmer, 1904.
- Peeters, Flor. Ars Organi. 3 vols. Brussels: Schott Frères, 1953, 1954.
- Trevor, C. H. The Oxford Organ Method. London: Oxford University Press, 1971.
- Viderø, Finn. Orgelschule. Copenhagen: Wilhelm Hansen, 1963.

Articles

- Andrews, Mildred. "Organ Teaching of 50 Years Surveyed by Master Teacher." The Diapason, LI (December, 1959), 12-13.
- Harris, David S. "Organ Teaching." Music/The AGO-RCCO Magazine, Vol. 2, No. 3 (May, 1968), pp. 23-24, 49-50.
- Helman, Harold. "From an Organist's Notebook." Musical Opinion, LXXVI (January, 1953), 241, 243.
- _____. "From an Organist's Notebook." Musical Opinion, LXXVII (May, 1954), 491, 493.

Theses

- Crawford, Jack R. "Mes Souvenirs by Louis Vierne: An Annotated Translation." Unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Miami, 1973.
- Hoffmann, John F. "A Study of Pedagogical Values Found in Selected Organ Works of Flor Peeters." Unpublished D.M.A. dissertation, University of Rochester, 1973.
- McDonald, Donald G. "Some Guilding Principles in the Art of Organ Study and Performance." Unpublished S.M.D. thesis, Union Theological Seminary, 1964.
- Ochse, Orpha C. "Pedagogical Implications of Research Studies in Three Determinants of Organ Performance Ability." Unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Rochester, 1953.
- Riddle, Pauline P. "Development of a Basic Foundation in Church Organ Technique for the Beginning Organist." Unpublished D.M.E. dissertation, University of Oklahoma, 1972.